Meaningful Access: Bridge Project

Jorge Rivera, Project Lead (MLS) | Bridge Project, Planning Department, Toronto Public Library

Kristian Roberts, Partner, Nordicity

Jan 31, 2020
What is Bridge?

The Bridge Technology Services Assessment Toolkit (Bridge) is a web-based solution for gathering and analyzing performance and outcome data in order to deliver efficient and effective services.
because if we don't measure, we can't improve
Measurement Objectives

1. **Availability** – the volume of technology services offered
2. **Usage** – the uptake of technology services
3. **Outcomes** – the activities and results from using technology services
4. **Service delivery** – how prepared frontline staff are to deliver technology services
Components:

- Patron survey
- Staff survey
- Administrator interface – availability and usage data
What is the difference?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scope of services</th>
<th>Technology</th>
<th>Technology</th>
<th>All</th>
<th>All</th>
<th>Technology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Internal measures</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patron survey</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activities</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outputs</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcome</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benchmarks</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
About the Process
Q1-Q3 2019
Bridge Cohort (28) collects data

Q2-Q3 2019
Bridge cohort (22) collects data

Q4 2019
Data analysis

2020
Redesign, process improvement, expansion

Q1 2020
Publishing and sharing

Representation – collect data – analyze data – advocate and act

Q3 2017
Pilot (7)
Who we are

50 participating library systems:

- 9 First Nation Libraries
- 4 Francophone Libraries
- 37 Public Libraries

Mix of small, medium and large-sized libraries.

Sample group is reflective of the types of libraries in Ontario
Results of the Beta
Participation rates and data caveats

- Patron survey responses: 25,207
- Staff survey responses: 25
- Availability and Usage Indicators: 24
- Edge 2.0 Assessment Results: 30

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Library Service</th>
<th>Number of Responses</th>
<th>Percent (%) of Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ontario Library Service - North</td>
<td>614</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southern Ontario Library Service</td>
<td>16,936</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>7,657</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>25,207</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Availability and Usage Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Connectivity</td>
<td>84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equipment and facilities</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One-on-one support</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technology class</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Connectivity**: 84% Used WiFi Internet Access
- **Equipment and facilities**: 38% Didn’t know but are interested in using Content and Editing Software
- **One-on-one support**: 25% Didn’t know but are interested in using Digital Design
- **Technology class**: 31% Didn’t know but are interested in using Programming and Coding
Availability and Usage Results

24 Ontario Library Average

- **87.63 Mbps**
  - Download speed

National Average

- **42.4 Mbps**
  - Download speed

Edge 2.0 Ontario Library Average

Benchmark 9: Technology Planning, Policies and Availability

- 67% Achieved
- 33% Possible Points

Results of Staff Surveys

92% Most/all of the questions

96% Received basic usage questions

Improve the staff ability to answer patron questions

- 71% More training on the technology services we provide
- 52% More time to use the services themselves
- 48% Better documentation and/or reference material (e.g., manuals)

Survey question: What would you need to improve your ability to answer patron questions?
Refresher on Outcome Areas

- **Primary outcomes:**
  - Digital Inclusion
  - Digital Literacy

- **Secondary outcomes:**
  - Community, Social and Civic Engagement
  - Creativity and Innovation
  - Entrepreneurship and Business Development
  - Workforce Development
Highlights of Primary Outcomes

- **Digital Inclusion**
  - 53% only access point to the technology service(s) that they used
  - 71% of them got access to the Internet through Wi-Fi

- **Digital Literacy**
  - 80% increased level of digital comfort.
  - Immigrants are likely to benefit more
  - 34% of the respondents reported being introduced to new technologies using technology services offered by the libraries.
  - 92% of them will continue to use that technology
Community, Social and Civic Engagement

Community Engagement

- 78% engaged with their community. First Nations are more likely to find it a lot helpful.

Social Engagement

- 80% connected with others to be more social. Immigrants are more likely to find learning new skills and find support for a personal issue.

Civic Engagement

- 33% accessed government services or resources online. Patrons 55 and older and low-income group are more likely to benefit.
- 40% got government forms; 37% of them learned about government programs or services.

Highlights of Secondary Outcomes
Creativity and Innovation

▪ 26% made a creative product. First Nations and Teenagers (13-18 age) are more likely to benefit.

▪ 6% of them used Content creation and editing software. 38% didn’t know the library offered it and are interested in using it.

▪ 6% of them used fabricating and manufacturing equipment and electronics, circuitry and robotics. 31% didn’t know about those two services and are interested in using them.

Entrepreneurship and Business Development

▪ 20% did business-related activities

▪ 85% hire less than 10 people
Workforce Development
Educational Activities
- 59% did educational activities. Younger patrons (24+), immigrants, and visible minorities were more likely to benefit.

Employable Skills
- 34% developed employable skills. Young patrons (25 - 34), and First Nations are more likely to benefit.

Job Search Skills and Success
- Among those who said they used the technology service(s) to develop skills related to finding a job, 62% identifying as First Nations had a high level of success in finding a job.
Improving the process
Tell your story + make positive changes
Benchmark 9: Technology Planning, Policies and Availability

Technology Planning

Key takeaways:
- Accessibility goals
- Routine technology testing, refresh cycles, disruption alerts, back-up/service continuity plans, session management software, service tracking

Based on 30 unique library assessments submitted between February 1 - October 1, 2019
Feedback from Libraries

- “Measures are important, we need more automatic ways of measuring our business” (Thunder Bay PL)

- “Robust outcome measures have new funding potential” (Mississauga PL)

- “Bridge has helped us improve our reporting, it’s more than just outputs” (Perth and District Union PL)

- “Expect Bridge and Edge to intensify the way in which we tell stories about impact, value and needs.” (Ajax PL)
Recommendations

- Collecting the Data
- Integrating Data Sources
- Analyzing and Presenting the Results
- Stimulating Informed Action
Benefits of an advanced Bridge Machine Learning Recommendation

More participants, more Impact

Machine Learning

Recommendation Engine
“Every Ontarian has convenient, local access to the technology they want and need, and the comfort and confidence to use it, so that they can access economic, educational, social, health and civic opportunities to achieve prosperity, advancement, and overall well-being.”